

DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN THE CITY ADMINISTRATION

TOOLKIT FOR EQUALITY CITY POLICIES AGAINST RACISM



International Coalition
of Inclusive and
Sustainable Cities – ICCAR



Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

TOOLKIT FOR EQUALITY CITY POLICIES AGAINST RACISM

DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN THE CITY ADMINISTRATION

THE CITY GETS ACTIVE IN ITS FUNCTION AS A

- democratic institution
- rule-maker
- **employer**
- **service provider**
- contractor

ECCAR 10 POINTS ACTION PLAN

- 1 Greater Vigilance Against Racism
- 2 Assessing Racism and Discrimination and Monitoring Municipal Policies
- 3 Better Support for the Victims of Racism and Discrimination
- 4 More Participation and Better Informed City Dwellers
- 5 The City as an Active Supporter of Equal Opportunity Practices
- 6 The City As An Equal Opportunities Employer and Service Provider**
- 7 Fair Access to Housing
- 8 Challenging Racism and Discrimination Through Education
- 9 Promoting Cultural Diversity
- 10 Hate Crimes and Conflicts Management

The project was coordinated by ETC Graz, realized with the following partners:

Stockholm University – SU (Sweden)

University of Padova - Human Rights Centre - HRC Padova (Italy)

Centre for European Constitutional Law – CECL (Greece)

Otherness Foundation - NEKI (Hungary)

Cidalia (Spain)

European Coalition of Cities against Racism (ECCAR e.V.)

UNESCO as member of ICCAR

Editors: Isabella Meier, Ingrid Nicoletti, Klaus Starl, Paul Lappalainen

Release 2.0 February 2017, Graz – Stockholm - Potsdam

The Toolkit for Equality is realized with support of the European Commission, UNESCO, the European Coalition of Cities against Racism (ECCAR), Open Society Foundation - At Home in Europe, ETC Graz, and the cities of Bern, Bologna, Esch-sur-Alzette, Ghent, Graz, Potsdam, Rotterdam, Vienna, and Zurich.

This publication has been produced with the financial support of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship (REC) Programme of the European Union (ADPOLIS JUST/2014/RDIS/AG/DISC/8084). The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of ETC Graz and its partners and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission.

INTRODUCTION

The Toolkit for Equality is a manual to support cities in implementing local policies that successfully counteract racism and racial discrimination or in adjusting existing ones. The Toolkit provides experience-based step-by-step instructions for implementing concrete policies, starting from the conceptualization and ending with measuring their impact. All content is based on expertise shared by experienced city officials working in European cities.

Our aim has been to give suggestions that are as concrete as possible. We invite you to read the toolkit as the joint expertise of colleagues in other cities and take whatever seems useful for your city.

The realization of this Toolkit would not have been possible without the support of cities and city employees, who shared their experiences, knowledge and time. ECCAR and the editors thank all of the participating cities for their contributions and hospitality, in particular:

Agia Varvara (Greece)	Madrid (Spain)
Athens (Greece)	Malmö (Sweden)
Barcelona (Spain)	Nantes (France)
Berlin (Germany)	Pecs (Hungary)
Bern (Switzerland)	Potsdam (Germany)
Bilbao (Spain)	Rotterdam (Netherlands)
Bologna (Italy)	Santa Cruz (Spain)
Botkyrka (Sweden)	Sevilla (Spain)
Budapest (Hungary)	Toulouse (France)
Castilla-La Mancha (Spain)	Turin (Italy)
Esch-sur-Alzette (Luxembourg)	Valencia (Spain)
Ghent (Belgium)	Vienna (Austria)
Graz (Austria)	Zurich (Switzerland)

DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN THE CITY ADMINISTRATION

WHY IS IT NECESSARY?	11
-----------------------------	-----------

FOUNDATION	13
-------------------	-----------

PLANNING AND ENGAGING STAKEHOLDERS	13
---	-----------

Step Politicians and civil servants taking responsibility for the topic	13
Step Political agreement to work on diversity management in the city	13
Step Appoint a coordinator /an administrative unit given responsibility for coordination of the process	13
Step Engaging key persons in the administration	14
Step Establish regular exchange with contact persons in each department	14

CONCEPT	16
----------------	-----------

→ RECRUITMENT: INCREASE DIVERSITY IN CITY STAFF	17
--	-----------

Step Workshop(s) with human resources managers	17
1. Take a close look at recruitment processes	17
2. Take a differentiated perspective to “migrant” employees	18
3. Design concrete measures	19
4. Establish clear goals to increase ethnic diversity among city staff	19
5. Discuss what a follow-up on implementation could look like	19
Step Document the results of the workshop(s) with human resource managers	20

→ SERVICE PROVISION: IMPROVE ACCESSIBILITY OF CITY SERVICES FOR ALL INHABITANTS	22
--	-----------

Step Workshops with service users (city inhabitants): Identification of needs	22
Step Workshops with service providers (civil servants)	23
1. Discuss what diversity means in public administration	23
2. Review accessibility to public services	23
3. Develop concrete measures	24
4. Discuss how a follow-up on implementation could look like	24
Step Document results of workshops with service providers (civil servants)	25

STRUCTURAL EMBEDDING	28
Step Draft a final document	28
Step Negotiate for political approval	28
Step Calculate the required resources	28
<hr style="border-top: 1px dashed #ccc;"/>	
PUTTING INTO PRACTICE	29
<hr style="border-top: 1px dashed #ccc;"/>	
→ DIVERSITY TRAININGS FOR CITY EMPLOYEES	31
Step Find a partner organisation to provide diversity trainings	31
<hr style="border-top: 1px dashed #ccc;"/>	
FOLLOW-UP	35
<hr style="border-top: 1px dashed #ccc;"/>	
SUSTAINABILITY	37
KEY FACTORS OF SUCCESS	38
IMPACT AND OUTCOME	39
→ DIVERSITY MONITORING	40
RESOURCES AND EXAMPLES	44

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN THE CITY ADMINISTRATION

When talking about diversity in the city administration we refer to all city employees as well as to all city inhabitants as addressees and customers of the city management. In line with human rights standards on non-discrimination, the diversity-dimensions in focus are characteristics like sex, ethnic origin or skin-colour, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, or association with a national minority. Diversity management therefore means considering the variety in those dimensions among city employees and inhabitants and making sure that those characteristics are no reason for preventing individuals of their fair chances – as an employee in the city administration or as customer of city services.

Diversity management in city administration is understood in this toolkit to encompass two goals: 1. having **employees with diverse backgrounds**, reflecting the composition of the city's population and 2. providing **municipal services that are available, accessible, acceptable and adaptable to all city inhabitants** given their diversity.

Successful diversity management in a city encompasses all above-mentioned dimensions of diversity. As this toolkit was elaborated in the framework of ECCAR, we will exemplify the concept and measures focussing on the dimension of ethnic origin and diversity management as a tool to prevent racial discrimination. In order to design a comprehensive diversity management concept, we however strongly recommend taking into consideration all dimensions of diversity and consulting representatives and experts accordingly.

The city as a democratic institution is responsible to ensure representation and participation of its citizens and to guarantee equality and non-discrimination. This consequently means that the diversity of the city's local population should be reflected in the composition of city officials – for reasons of equality, participation and accessibility of services.

The city as an employer serves as a role-model for other employers, as the municipality is usually one of the largest employers in the region. City inhabitants should have (and understand that they have) a fair chance in applying for employment in the city as well as in regard to reaching higher positions. It is in the city's interest to recruit the best qualified employees and make sure that the best qualified job applicants are not disregarded due to irrelevant factors such as sex or ethnicity. Diversity management also aims at profiting from the employees' diversity in skills and competences. Thus, in the human rights and non-discrimination context, staff diversity is not only about equal opportunities, but also about equal treatment in its more narrow sense.

The city as a service provider is responsible to serve all its inhabitants without discrimination. That means that the city's services should be equally accessible and acceptable for all city inhabitants. In order to provide services in that way, a city has to understand their inhabitants'

needs and take the diversity of needs into consideration. The idea is to open up regular services to the whole population instead of providing specialized services, while at the same time taking into account specific needs, like the situation of city dwellers that have difficulties with the majority language. It is important that people know about their rights and have a real opportunity to exercise those rights. Municipal services are to a large extent strongly linked to human rights, particularly health care, social services, social welfare education etc. are guaranteed by international human rights treaties. The UN convention on racial discrimination (CERD), the convention on the rights of persons with disabilities (CRPD) as well as the women's rights convention CEDAW prohibit discrimination in delivering such services. Diversity mainstreaming in municipal service delivery therefore pursues the objective of guaranteeing equality.

The aspects mentioned are interlinked: City personnel that reflect the composition of the city's population will be more likely to be receptive to the varying needs of a diverse clientele and be able to understand the qualifications needed to provide services adequately. An administration that is perceived as a non-discriminating equal opportunity employer of diverse personnel will be a more attractive employer in relation to qualified persons with diverse backgrounds.

This chapter provides you with practical guidance on a comprehensive diversity policy in administration, including advice on how to develop measures that

1. increase diversity in city staff and
2. improve accessibility of city services to all city inhabitants.

To support diversity in day-to-day work, the chapter also discusses

3. diversity trainings for city employees

and suggests a follow-up on the measures implemented by means of

4. diversity monitoring.

The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD) defines that ***“racial discrimination shall mean any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, colour, descent or national or ethnic origin [...]”***.

“Distinction” means to define a person as different on the basis of “race”, colour, ethnicity, descent, birth, religion or language (addressing biological and cultural ascriptions), justifying differentiated entitlements on a structural level. The opposite of distinction is equality. Equality is meant as a status as well as a process.

“Exclusion” means denying access to and enjoyment of human rights. The European Union adopted the term social exclusion defined by the ILO, but widened the definition stressing

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

that social exclusion occurs when people cannot fully participate or contribute to society because of “*the denial of civil, political, social, economic and cultural rights.*” It is indicated in the definitions that exclusion results from “*a combination of linked problems such as unemployment, poor skills, low incomes, poor housing, bad health and family breakdown.*” Participation is a precondition for as well as a purpose of human rights. The opposite of exclusion is *inclusion*.

“*Restriction*” means a limitation of enjoyment of human rights in practice. The positive counterpart is to have “equal opportunities”.

“*Preference*” privileges a person on grounds of “race”, colour, ethnicity, descent, birth, religion or language over another person. Symmetrically, it disadvantages one person compared to another. The positive answer to this formal understanding is “equal treatment”. Policies successfully counteracting racial discrimination therefore need to contribute to the positive counterparts of the four dimensions of discrimination.

Counteracting discrimination therefore means to increase equality, inclusion, equal opportunities and/or equal treatment.

→ The policy of **DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN THE ADMINISTRATION** as described in this chapter counteracts discrimination by promoting all of these dimensions.

CONTEXT INFORMATION

The following chapter is based on interviews with different actors involved in the implementation of Diversity Management in the Cities of Berlin (Germany), Bern (Switzerland), Bologna (Italy), Botkyrka (Sweden), Ghent (Belgium), Graz (Austria), and Vienna (Austria). Additional information gained from other cities was also included in order to present the policy from as broad a perspective as possible.

WHY IS IT NECESSARY?

- The city complies with its democratic/constitutional/human rights obligation of representation of the population.
- Diversity in administration creates an inclusive environment for all inhabitants. Inhabitants feel represented by the city officials and thereby have a greater sense of belonging, which positively affects the sense of social cohesion. Inhabitants have greater trust in the local government and administration.
- Diversity management is change management: the administration gets better adapted to the (changing) world it has to deal with. The city gains experience in dealing with diverse employees and inhabitants.
- The administration benefits from various perspectives among those in higher positions in local government. It counteracts limitations in regards to developing outreach efforts and implementing the strategies needed. The city administration has a better knowledge and understanding of diverse local needs and conditions in the municipality.
- The city recruits the applicants best qualified for the specific positions. Recruitment procedures do not disregard well-qualified job applicants due to characteristics that are irrelevant for doing the job. Those measures automatically contribute to reducing discrimination.
- Employees work in positions that correspond to their qualifications and skills. Employees' satisfaction is higher and the city profits from their skills and motivation.
- City inhabitants have (and understand that they have) a fair chance in applying for employment in the city as well as in reaching higher positions. This makes the city an attractive employer to qualified applicants. Opening recruitment to a larger population counteracts the possible shortage of skilled personnel.
- The municipality, usually one of the largest employers, serves as a role model for other employers.
- Diverse teams in service provision are better equipped to deal with a diversity of clients, e.g. in terms of effective communication (range of languages, interpreting clients' behaviour adequately). Providing services that meet the clients' needs increases client satisfaction.
- Public employees get more satisfaction in their job if they are able to solve clients' requests. The feeling that they can actively improve their working environment as well as the positive impact of their work motivates civil servants.
- Civil servants profit from an exchange of experiences and benefit from personal contacts established through networking activities. It is a great help to have reliable contacts in other departments.

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

→ Why is it necessary?

LIMITATIONS

Diversity in administration is not a one-time undertaking that can be implemented once and is done, but a long-term process that requires continuous efforts and support for those efforts.

Diversity management means more than simply having employees with diverse backgrounds. Discrimination in career development – “a glass ceiling” – might be a prevailing issue (e.g. if migrant workers are employed only in the low-skilled or gender-biased sectors of public administration).

FOUNDATION

PLANNING AND ENGAGING STAKEHOLDERS

1

STEP Politicians and civil servants taking responsibility for the topic

It is recommended to develop greater competence in the field of diversity management in administration through discussions with civil society organisations, migrant representatives and researchers. Having access to international research reports and thus examples of work in other cities is important – there are also examples in this chapter as well as in the Annex. It is also important to find out what kind of efforts and measures are already in place in your city.

Expand the basis of political support by promoting the topic at the political level via internal and cross-party discussion. Lobby for an understanding of the need to increase the representativeness of the government and administration's employees. Articulate the need to move from words to action.

2

STEP Political agreement to work on diversity management in the city

Present the project to city government members.

Cities report that they chose to implement diversity management not by a decision of the city parliament/legislative body but via a decision taken by all members of the city government. The reason is that diversity management concerns the area of human resources which is the responsibility of the heads/managers of administrative departments, and not a legislative measure binding the population.

Ask the heads of departments to appoint a contact person in the department.

3

STEP Appoint a coordinator /an administrative unit given responsibility for coordination of the process

It is strongly recommended that the coordinator is a person/a team from within the administration and not an external process coordinator. Coordinating a process within the context of a city administration requires good knowledge of internal routines and close contact with those persons who know how things are done in each respective department. It can however be useful to have an external partner, e.g. an association that provides diversity trainings, in order to have access to specialized expertise on diversity, workshop moderation and training methods.

In the participating cities, the coordination was done by a “diversity”- or “integration”- division. This works well if this division has a place in the administrative hierarchy that allows for contacts

with the political level as well as other departments' administration without too many intermediary hierarchical steps (e.g. a subdivision of the mayor's office or head of administration).

The coordinator/ team should be committed to following the entire process, from engaging stakeholders to following-up on the measures to be implemented.

Coordinators' role:

- be the motor for the whole process
- provide expert diversity advice to departments
- contact and involve external experts where their expertise is needed
- organise and prepare meetings and workshops
- moderate workshops, ideally together with a diversity trainer
- summarize results and defined goals
- list all measures decided upon, draft the plan
- do all the writing work: meetings' minutes, list of measures, draft action plan, templates for reporting, newsletters, good practices etc.
- follow-up on implementation

4

STEP Engaging key persons in the administration

Start by approaching individuals who are already active in the field, those who want to do something and are interested in getting support for their work. Try to ensure that contact persons are appointed in the different departments who are open to the idea.

The method of storytelling is recommended: Talk about already existing examples in your city that show that diversity in administration has positive effects.

You could also organise an event and invite a colleague/colleagues from other cities to talk about their successful practices. Experience shows that open resistance against diversity measures is rare, while reluctance and reservations persist. Stories of successful implementation show the need, benefit and feasibility of diversity and may convince reluctant actors. Talking about successful practices and learning from these stories creates more openness. It is also recommended that lessons learned from trial-and-error situations are examined, so that the reasons and possible solutions can be discussed.

When engaging stakeholders in the public administration on behalf of diversity measures, it is recommended that an outcome-oriented approach is followed. This can be done by asking "what works well and in which municipal department?" It is also recommended that a best practice approach is not used. Asking "which department is the best in doing xyz?" can cause problems as this implicates a ranking between departments.

5

STEP Establish regular exchange with contact persons in each department

Get together with contact persons. Ask them to explain to you what their daily routine in the departments looks like, what issues are important to them, who are the key persons that need to be involved, and how can you undertake a meaningful process together. Discuss possible procedures for developing a participatory approach.

Be open and flexible to the use of different approaches concerning different departments or city districts.

Stakeholders needed for diversity management in administration

- Political leaders
- Coordinator/coordinating unit
- Human resources managers
- Key persons from the respective departments
- Trainers / a training organization experienced in providing diversity trainings, preferably also experienced in working with administrative personnel
- Civil servants (from all fields of work and all city districts)

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Opposition to the idea.

Interviewees recommended not putting too much energy into breaking resistance or convincing actors who are too difficult to convince. This takes too much in the way of resources and has produces little outcome. It makes more sense to work with actors who are already favourable. With those persons it is possible to get into constructive discussions and an exchange of successful methods, instead of spending hours on debating the need for action in the first place.

Reluctance, reservation and subtle resistance to the idea. There is always a challenge in introducing something that has the potential to change the way “things have always been done”.

Be prepared that there will be less open resistance but rather subtle reservations (not “we do not need that!” but constant “do we really need that?”). Storytelling based on successful examples of implementing diversity management in public administration is a more effective tool.

CONCEPT

The conceptual key points suggested by the participating cities are the following:

Take a **participatory approach**:

The participatory approach aims at creating ownership in the administration of measures to promote diversity, encouraging civil servants to reflect on what diversity means in the context of a city's administration and exchanging points of views between service providers and users.

If public employees are expected to care for the implementation of measures, they should be offered the possibility to participate in the development of the measures and have a chance to express their professional opinions. Measures that are designed and selected in a participatory approach will have greater acceptance.

Method: Moderated workshops serve to develop clear and feasible measures and activities together with target groups from within the administration (human resources managers, civil servants at service desks, etc.) and outside the administration (service users).

The measures developed are listed in a multi-annual plan that is submitted to be issued as a directive by the city government (as heads of administration).

A comprehensive plan is recommended that includes the following elements:

1 - Measures to **increase diversity in city staff**

2 - Measures to **improve accessibility of city services for all inhabitants**

The implementation of the measures developed is supported and accompanied by **diversity trainings for city employees** in order to provide for sustainable diversity management.

Follow-up: The plan should already outline a method and mandate for following-up on the implementation of measures. In addition to short-term follow-up events and progress reports, it is recommended that some form of **diversity monitoring is foreseen**, in order to assess the long-term impact of diversity management.

Tip! Define the goals clearly in order to make progress and achievements measurable. Give priority to small-scale but clear goals rather than ambitious but vague goals. At the same time, leave room for flexibility in order to make necessary changes based on unexpected issues that come up in the course of implementation, e.g. do not define benchmarks for the number of participants in workshops but focus instead on if the workshops had tangible results (concrete measures developed, implementation of measures developed etc.).

→ RECRUITMENT: INCREASE DIVERSITY IN CITY STAFF

6

STEP Workshop(s) with human resources managers

Get together with human resources managers of the city's departments and/or a central human resources management in order to:

1. Take a close look at recruitment processes

Together take a critical look at processes in recruitment, job descriptions, employee evaluation and promotion. The aim is to examine the city's needs while at the same time encouraging qualified persons to apply for jobs in the city administration.

- What does diversity mean in public administration?
- Who is represented in the public personnel and who is not? Is there something in the recruitment routine that makes public employment more or less accessible to certain groups?
- Are we doing anything to exclude persons with a "non-national" background, given our routines or the qualifications that are required?
- Do the requirements actually reflect the needs the city has? For example, do we require national high school degrees or is it enough with a high school degree?
- Is it considered an extra qualification if a person speaks not only the national language but other languages spoken by inhabitants?
- How job vacancies are made public? Who is addressed through those communication channels?
- What are standard requirements in job description? Which qualification is really needed for which position? For example, to what degree is knowledge of the national language, written or oral, necessary for what kind of work?
- In which positions is it an advantage to speak (also) other language(s)?
- Is the recruitment process adequate to identify the qualifications needed? For example, if a department wants to assess the applicant's skills in park maintenance: Is it really necessary to ask the technical terms in the national language or could you use images to find out if an applicant knows which tools or machines to use for a given task?

Is diversity competence an aspect in job description, job advertisement and job interviews? Diversity competence should be particularly relevant concerning management positions.

→ Recruitment: Increase diversity in city staff

Tip! Discuss the issue of how to understand and examine qualifications including the notion of ‘diversity competence’. To provide you with a definition: ‘Diversity competence’ is the ability to deal with differences in personalities and ways of life in a sensible and adequate manner. Developing diversity competence starts with critically reflecting one’s own prejudices and being aware of commonalities and differences in individuals’ needs. It is important to know about the diversity in the society and the barriers that might prevent some individuals and groups from participating equally. Diversity competence means to acknowledge another person as an individual and to avoid stereotype thinking. Finally yet importantly, diversity competence requires the knowledge and ability how to realize non-discrimination and equal chances in a concrete environment.

2. Take a differentiated perspective to “migrant” employees

Together think about how to take the next step to recruit personnel that is more ethnically diverse.

Tip! When talking about ethnic diversity in administration, many people have a particular group of “migrants” in mind and quickly associate the issue of language barriers. Point out that there are various target groups with very different levels of skills. It is recommended to subsequently address the following three target groups.

1st target group: *Ambitious and well-qualified persons with migrant backgrounds* (who speak the national language; this target group includes mainly persons who are born or have grown up in the country). Objective: Make employment in the public administration more attractive to this group and encourage applications by showing that the city is not only an employer for the native/indigenous population. Method: Visiting schools in order to inform about job opportunities in the public administration; Peer-to-peer approach: Young successful employees in public administration tell their career stories in schools, in communities.

2nd target group: *Ambitious and well-qualified migrants*. Objective: Make use of migrants’ good qualifications and language skills; Employ migrants in positions relevant to their qualifications. Method: Re-assess which levels of national language skills are actually required for working in which specific position; hire qualified employees and support them in improving their skills in the national language (free language courses etc.).

3rd target group: *Low-qualified migrants* or persons with migrant background (particularly teenagers with little or no education). Objective: Show that even teenagers with low education skills still have a chance and can be recruited into public administration. Method: Provide traineeships, including traineeships that offer the possibility to study at the university later on. Advertise those possibilities to teenagers (e.g. in occupational orientation); also address parents with information. Focus on the applicant’s motivation in recruitment selections, e.g. by not demanding education certificates in the first round of applications.

3. Design concrete measures

Examples of measures taken in the participating cities:

- Promoting public employment in schools, by young civil servants with migrant backgrounds;
- Expanding channels to advertise job vacancies;
- Using images of tools/machines instead of technical terms in order to find out if a person knows what tool to use for what task;
- Providing courses in the national language for employees;
- Integrating diversity competence as a requirement in all job descriptions; Explicitly acknowledging knowledge of different languages as a qualification in job descriptions;
- Networking with the communities (teenagers can be better reached through targeted campaigns if there is also some kind of information for the parents)
- Lowering the threshold in first round of applications can give more weight to an applicant's particular motivation.

4. Establish clear goals to increase ethnic diversity among city staff

Identify the status quo and set a reasonable goal. One researched city determined that they were at about the level of 18% personnel with foreign background, and decided that 30% was a reasonable goal for a 3 to 4-year plan. The city actually achieved a ratio of 26-27% during the period at issue.

While the use of quotas would violate the EU directives, the use of specific targets or goals is somewhat different. The whole point is to underline that a target is just that, a target which is to be achieved by counteracting discrimination and casting a larger net that encourages increased numbers of qualified persons from underrepresented groups to apply. EU case law developed in relation to sex/gender discrimination concerning positive treatment allows choosing the person from the underrepresented group only if they have the same merits or essentially the same merits. Specific targets can be useful instruments, particularly regarding recruitment to higher positions. If a target is established, human resources managers are challenged both in terms of reaching out to larger numbers of qualified applicants as well convincing employees of the need for change.

Tip! A target is not the same thing as a quota. Specific numbers can underline the importance of the target. At the same time it is important to understand that what is needed is a good faith effort to reach the target and not that the target should be reached by any means necessary. In this way it is made clear that the number is a goal and not a quota.

Having clear-cut goals allows for a serious follow-up. It also provides a signal to civil society concerning the determination of policymakers as well as providing a chance to civil society to follow up the political promises that are inherent in such a goal. This can in turn help to ensure sustainability.

5. Discuss what a follow-up on implementation could look like

Think about a procedure of reporting on progress and results that does not produce a lot of extra work, but nevertheless ensures a good follow-up (see below).

→ Recruitment: Increase diversity in city staff

7

STEP Document the results of the workshop(s) with human resource managers

Write down the workshop results agreed upon: measures and actions, defined goals, people in charge, time frame, resources calculated, and follow-up methods.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Lack of awareness. Public administration is seen as neutral and accessible by everyone, as it is based on a meritocratic principle and objective recruitment procedures that select the best qualified applicants.

Refer to unintended exclusion mechanisms, e.g. in the design of entrance tests, in the setting of job advertisement, in interviews. There is a lack of awareness on how these procedures are organized.

Critics “You are so committed to improving the situation for minorities but what about the under-privileged nationals?”

These critics are a strong argument to introduce a comprehensive diversity strategy that addresses all diversity dimensions (age, sex, disability, ethnic origin etc.) which exactly aims at taking into considerations ALL city inhabitants. The focus on non-discrimination is important to under-privileged nationals as well. It is recommended to avoid getting entangled in such debates that are strongly carried by individuals opposed to the idea of diversity on principle.

Time constraints for developing the measures and plans.

If the plan needs to be handed in within 2-3 months, this is not serious in regard to the development of a big action plan. It is better then to decide on a smaller but concrete action plan, thus establishing a good starting point for becoming more active. Prepare for a more comprehensive action plan that will follow the current one.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Lack of clarity by what the terms “diversity” and “foreign backgrounds” mean. Who is or should be counted as having a “foreign background”? Variety of definitions.

How to identify diversity competence?
How to assess these skills?

There is a lot of expertise available on these topics, involve external experts in accordance with appropriate criteria.

People are afraid that heterogeneous teams will create more conflicts.

Experience shows that this is not the case as long as the teams are managed in a diversity competent way. If recruitment processes are properly designed for choosing candidates who are well qualified for their positions and are carried out in a professional manner vis-à-vis the tasks at hand and the colleagues involved, a diversity in ethnic backgrounds does not cause specific conflicts.

Diverse teams do not necessarily understand each other better than others, but open-mindedness and mutual understanding is higher and the resolution of complex tasks is more effective.

Reach target groups, e.g. youths

Youths are best reached via peers, tutorial systems and videos. Successful examples coming from a person’s own peer-group are most convincing.

Counter argument to diversity in recruitment: “There are not enough qualified applicants with migrant backgrounds.”

Have a look at recruitment routines (see text above).

→ Recruitment: Increase diversity in city staff
 Service provision: Improve accessibility of city services for all inhabitants

RISKS, CHALLENGES

Counter argument to diversity in recruitment: “What if we have clients who demand to have a “national” person?”

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Focus on the objective qualifications required. Any person well qualified can and should deliver the respective service. And be accepted for delivering the service.



→ SERVICE PROVISION: IMPROVE ACCESSIBILITY OF CITY SERVICES FOR ALL INHABITANTS

Organise workshops with the relevant target groups to design concrete measures for each of the three aspects of diversity management (see below).

Tip! For all workshops and meetings it is important to communicate that it is a process that has a goal and results. To invite people to talk, with nothing happening afterwards is harmful to the current and future participatory processes. The final “product” should be a catalogue of feasible measures.



STEP Workshops with service users (city inhabitants): Identification of needs

Organise workshops with migrant communities’ representatives, NGOs, and civil society competence centres on diversity.

Whom to invite: If you want to invite representatives of migrant communities and NGOs, the selection can be challenging. Be careful to communicate that the aim is to invite some of the interest groups because it will be difficult to hear all of them and also not useful to make a workshop with too many participants. Make use of already established contacts. Document on what basis you made the selection.

In the workshop, discuss the service users’ perspective on the city’s service provision: Are city services accessible to all? Who might have difficulties in accessing various services? What could the city administration do to make services more accessible? What could the city administration do to better meet the variety of needs? Why are some city services used more by one group and less by others? etc.

Workshop setting: One recommendation is that workshops should be scheduled to take place at about 4-6 p.m. If it takes longer or is scheduled at later time, think about providing something to eat. Also think about providing for child care. Workshops on weekends are not recommended. As an alternative to workshops, a needs assessment could also be done with a needs assessment survey (inviting service users to fill out a questionnaire). However, this method is only recommended addressing clearly defined issues, e.g. if there is a focus on a particular service or (small) group of service users.

9

STEP Workshops with service providers (civil servants)

Organize workshops with the persons relevant to the work on a topic:

- a) *inner-administrative issue*: workshop only with civil servants
- b) *topic that concerns different actors*, e.g. one city's department chooses the topic of how the administration should deal with interest conflicts between different groups concerning the use of a public park: a workshop that includes representatives from all of the groups involved. If external actors are to be part of the solution they need to be included into the process. This is an opportunity for the administration to establish contacts with these groups. It is important to keep a focus on how civil servants can deal with the tasks they are confronted with, regarding the chosen topic; not discussing how different user groups should interact but how civil servants can act when confronted with conflicts etc.

1. Discuss what diversity means in public administration

Key words and mission statements often include the term diversity but when it comes to the implementation of these ideas, there is a lack of concrete initiatives and action. Therefore the first step in conceptualizing diversity measures with the administration is to discuss the following question:

- What does diversity mean to you/in your working context?
- In what situations is that relevant to you? In what situations is it not relevant?
- Who uses your services and who does not? How do you make the services known in the population?
- Is there something in your daily routine that makes certain services more or less accessible for some groups?
- Who is visible in city information material and PR strategies and who is not?

The workshops aim at encouraging civil servants to reflect on what diversity means in their daily work and to develop ideas from their own practice. The goal is to improve accessibility of services while addressing the needs of civil servants in charge of realizing that goal.

Local/participants' priorities can be addressed; Example: one city district was interested in understanding why a park was not used by some groups of inhabitants.

2. Review accessibility to public services

Bear in mind the relationship of structures and people: Review work routines to identify where structural issues may be responsible for lack of access and/or discriminatory behaviour.

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Practise
Follow-up

→ Service provision: Improve accessibility of city services for all inhabitants

Example: a civil servant at a service desk reported “I understand what you mean but I only have 4 minutes for every client. If there is a person who does not understand the language and I have to repeat and give long explanations, I can see how the queue gets longer and I get stressed”.

3. Develop concrete measures

Develop and formulate concrete, feasible measures.

Example from one city: A measure was to organize service desks differently: The counters in the immigration office used to be organized along the first letter of the names. Now they are organized along languages skills.

A fairly concrete policy is more likely to gain acceptance.

4. Discuss how a follow-up on implementation could look like

Think about a procedure of reporting/exchange on progress and results that do not produce a lot of extra work, but nevertheless ensure a good follow-up (see below).

Workshop setting

Moderation: It is recommended that there is a moderator for the workshops, preferably an external person experienced in workshop-moderation.

Tip! Define the boundaries of these workshops: What will be done with the results, what kinds of results are needed? What is the scope of the intervention? What can actually be implemented? (e.g. make clear that construction measures are not within the scope of possibilities). It is also important to convince participants that the goal is not just a collection of ideas but the designing of concrete measures as well as the follow up procedure.

Setting: Schedule about 3 workshops; start with discussing the meaning of diversity and proceed to the formulation of concrete measures. Experience shows that motivation of participants as well as mutual trust within the groups increases in the second or third meeting. The atmosphere becomes more relaxed and productive. In the last meeting, summarize the goals and measures.

Group size: The ideal group size depends on the way of working. A big group of 30 participants in a formal setting with changing participants can work if the participants are used to working in a concentrated and independent manner. In a context where the workshop is to serve to build trust and individual contacts, it is recommended to have a maximum of 15 participants.

Time: Find an agreement that civil servants can participate in the workshops in their working hours. If you want to include external participants, it is recommended to schedule the workshop at about 4-6 p.m.

Tip! The coordinator should be prepared for the idea that this is an open process that can move in different paths than expected. You cannot exactly know at the beginning what will come out in the end. Consider every result as a good start; whatever is missing can be worked on later. Example of one city: the coordinator invited leading managers to a workshop but they sent their employees. You can either see that as a failure or think about what you can do with the persons that are there. It turned out that the participants were very interested and engaged in taking on the role of multipliers within their departments.

10

STEP Document results of workshops with service providers (civil servants)

Write down the workshop results agreed upon: measures and actions, defined goals, people in charge, time frames, resources calculated as necessary and follow-up methods.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Discussions might shift the focus from the relationship between the administration and the service users – how the city can ensure that public services are accessible to all - to discussing the relationship between different population groups (e.g. conflicts between user groups; why one group has more “problems” than another etc.)

Stay focused: What does this have to do with the city administration? What does this mean to the daily routines in administration? How should I deal with this topic as a civil servant in my day-to-day work? Does it make a difference? Which difference? Is it relevant?

During the process, new topics and questions arise.

Be prepared that implementation is a work in progress.

Workshop participants are irritated due work on open questions like “what does diversity mean to you?” and react by justifying anticipated criticism, e.g. pointing out that you cannot adapt to every individual wish etc.

In spite of the irritation risk, avoid pre-selecting topics. Topics should be selected together. After initial discussions, introduce what the user groups said in the needs assessment workshops. Discuss those perceptions with the civil servants.

→ Service provision: Improve accessibility of city services for all inhabitants

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Discussions and activities develop slowly and do not always move in the expected direction.

It is not purposeful and not in the power of the coordinator to impose a pace. While trying to be a motor, the coordinators need to adapt to the pace of the participants and accept that things may take different paths than the expected ones.

It can be difficult to determine the proper administrative level from which to search for participants.

Leaders are important; people at lower levels can function as multipliers in their specific field.

Important fields/individuals are missing.

Start with the team you can get in the beginning. If participants are motivated by the process and are aware that important persons are missing, they might take initiative to bring those persons in.

Civil servants might not yet have thought about who uses their services and be irritated by this question (answer: "everyone who wants to")

It is a process of reflection concerning daily routines.

Public employees often experienced that they participate in workshops and meetings, express their ideas, develop concepts, and yet nothing happens.

Discuss these experiences and explain the ways in which their ideas will be dealt with and what the framework of implementation is. Clearly define and communicate the scope of the project. Make realistic promises, such as, we cannot guarantee that all of your ideas will be implemented but at least it is agreed with the mayor that she/he will take them into account in a serious manner.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

The public sector is not very experienced in cross-department coordination and networking.

Civil servants tend to think within the boundaries of their departments' powers. They want to avoid offending other departments; they point out that the budget for the next years is already set and there are no resources for additional measures. Thus they are reluctant about suggesting ideas and quickly call suggestions from others into question. They focus on "what cannot work" rather than "what could work".

Networking and exchange of experience within departments, and moreover across departments, might not be part of the administrative culture. People might not be used to coming together to discuss different perspectives.

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

The workshops themselves are a means with which to deal with the lack of coordination and networking. However the workshop moderators need to be prepared for this and not expect that there are established networks.

Experience shows that moderating workshops as a team effort made up of an external moderator and an administrative coordinator worked most effectively. The administrative person can give examples of what has worked in other cities or city districts under comparable conditions. The idea is to develop ideas which can hopefully gain support across departmental borders. Prepare workshops by collecting good examples.

Provide for networking events and initiate occasions for meetings where formal and informal exchanges can take place concerning implementation of the policy.

STRUCTURAL EMBEDDING

11

STEP Draft a final document

Draft a final document, summarizing the measures developed in the participatory workshops. Set clear goals and define the areas of responsibility that apply.

Provide for the structural embedding of diversity trainings for city employees in order to better secure those being held.

Define a clear mandate for the follow-up team on the implementation and outcome of measures.

Tip! Making clear from the beginning that the coordinator will be in charge of all the writing work opens doors to departments/participants that are in principle interested in participating but fear the additional work load.

12

STEP Negotiate for political approval

Negotiate a decision on the document by the political leaders. The agreement of the all city government members is necessary (the mayor's support alone is usually not sufficient) because you need to work with all departments.

A clear mandate for the coordinating team to follow-up on the implementation of measures is crucial.

13

STEP Calculate the required resources

Staff: A coordinator from within the administration/an administrative unit that coordinates the implementation of the plan. The work load depends on the size of the city and the concrete plan. One to two fulltime posts may serve as a rough guideline.

A follow-up team is needed. That does not necessarily mean that they have to be full time. But they need to have a mandate and the time and other resources to collect and analyse reports from different departments as well as providing training on how to achieve the goals.

Budget: The cities reported that addressing diversity in the administration is not a big issue in regard to financing. Much of the work is to be carried out as part of normal recruitment processes. Resources are however needed for actions and activities to develop these issues, as well as for diversity trainings. Annual budgets of Euro 1/city inhabitant for follow-up and equality measures were reported as being planned and spent.

Time: Multi-year plan; one year for participatory development of measures

PUTTING INTO PRACTICE

14

STEP Continuous implementation of measures

The continuous implementation of measures requires actively engaged public employees. Pay attention to the structural framework if implementation does not work as expected, e.g. time constraints, work overload. Document such structural constraints and discuss in which way to report that to department leaders.

Work with those who want to do something and may act as multipliers. To address those who want to block the efforts is frustrating, and coercive measures are reported to be without any significant effect. At the same time, clear commitment from the top, from the politicians, should piece by piece lead to an erosion of the opposition.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

An underlying or quiet opposition among various politicians and civil servants, resulting in an uneven reception and implementation

The policy will not only be challenged due to opposition based on various types of prejudices; there is also the power of the status quo which in itself creates a great deal of pushback concerning proposed changes.

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Follow up by a specific team that has a mandate to investigate and clarify unclear issues. This could provide an indirect control through informal contacts.

Political leaders need to exercise clear leadership and demonstrate that they want to see results. Emphasize that city life and working conditions are changing, whether individuals like it or not, and that diversity management has the potential of a change management that improves civil servants' working conditions ("you are doing something for yourself").

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Changes in personnel (management and leading staff) can easily lead to moving the focus, consciously or subconsciously, away from the diversity strategy.

It proved fruitful to provide introductory training to politicians after each election. This in turn provides them with some of the tools needed for leading the administration.

Intensive efforts to embed the understanding and the policy in the front lines. The more it is embedded and understood in the front lines of administration, the more sustainable it is regardless of changes in management.

Integrate the topic of diversity and diversity management into the regular training for new managerial staff (see section on training below).

Initial slow start

One way is pointing out the need to fulfil the ECCAR 10-Point-Plan of Action agreed to by the political leadership.

Time constraints and a work overload prevent implementation of measures or changes in behaviour.

Here, it is important to address work routine processes and the structural framework when developing the concept (see above). Document such barriers.

Big differences in the quality of diversity management in different city departments

Strong strategic management and leadership is needed as well as active use of available management tools such as target agreements

Creating synergy effects and promoting exchanges of experience

Structured and regular exchanges of good practices by the coordinating unit, e.g. via networking events, knowledge platforms, internal newsletters etc.

RISKS, CHALLENGES**MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS**

Communicate the city as an attractive employer for a diversity of people

Campaigns using the slogan “[name of the city] needs you!”, information in schools, in vocational guidance and counselling etc.

Raise awareness that diversity competence is a fundamental competence for every person working within the city administration

Integrate diversity training content into the basic and regular trainings for city employees and managers.

→ DIVERSITY TRAININGS FOR CITY EMPLOYEES

The long-term objective is to establish and implement diversity management in a way that it becomes normal rather than something special. Diversity competence as the ability to deal with others in a way that is sensitive to their individual needs is a useful qualification for all kinds of the municipalities’ employment positions, be it in management, recruitment or service provision. Awareness raising in form of trainings can enable employees to Diversity training should therefore be an integral part of employees’ further training.

15

STEP Find a partner organisation to provide diversity trainings

Ideally there is a training organisation experienced in providing diversity training that already has an established cooperation with the city administration. The coordinator and the trainer(s) should discuss and develop training content together, in order to make sure that there is a consistent understanding of diversity.

Target groups:

- management level personnel
- human resources managers
- civil servants

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

→ Diversity trainings for city employees

Method:

What was reported to be most effective is training that encourages participants to reflect and work on examples they themselves experienced at work. This includes role playing, case analyses and “dilemma training”, working on real situations – interactions with clients in the service desks/office hours – that were experienced as challenging by the participants.

Design trainings around those situations that arise in the chosen context: What does diversity mean in your work context? What kind of situations did you experience? How could you deal with such a situation? What do you need to act like that?

Participants describe situations in their daily work and analyse how they react in such interactions. Trainers and participants together develop alternative forms of reaction which are more effective and more satisfying for the persons involved. The change of perspective is a central element of the trainings.

The closer the cases addressed in the trainings are linked to the participants’ work routines, the more visible the benefits of training will become.

Examples of situations that were brought up by participants in workshops:

- A paramedic is called to an accident involving a patient wearing a headscarf – can he just take it off like he would usually do with narrow clothing around the neck?
- A civil servant at a service desk has a client who does not understand what she is saying, while the queue of clients gets longer and longer.
- How to deal with a woman who refuses to sit in a room with a man or to talk with a man? How should you react if a male client does not want to have contact with a female public employee? Am I allowed to demand cooperation by the person? What are my alternatives?
- A client insults another client – how to intervene?
- A civil servant is pressured in his private surroundings to justify why he supports a policy of welcoming immigrants.

Training group: Having mixed teams is recommended, half public officials and half members of civil society. Experience shows that the two groups inspire each other and exchange experiences in the course of the training. Heterogeneous groups are generally recommended, except with regard to the hierarchical level. Hierarchical levels should not be mixed; in this case, homogeneous groups work better.

Motivating public employees to self-reflection: Trainings should initiate self-reflection in order to distinguish between the professional and the personal role since a person’s self-assessment and behaviour do not always match. Participants are invited to reflect on their reactions, e.g. how do I react when clients are not on time? How do I communicate? A person who says, “my department’s services are equally accessible to all” refuses to acknowledge that it could be more difficult for some group. Sensitivity training should be held in relation to unintended exclusion through speech, behaviour or focus topics. The training should sensitize but not stigmatize those who are not so aware of diversity issues.

Voluntary vs. obligatory training: In voluntary training, participants are more motivated, but usually the persons who take part are those who are already sensitized concerning the issues and already have a certain competence. Voluntary trainings have a better working atmosphere. If trainings are obligatory, it must be clear to the participants why these trainings are needed, why they are obligatory and how they are embedded in the training structure. Experience shows that employees in lower hierarchies are informed about the obligatory participation in a hierarchic tone, and feel punished and degraded. Under these circumstances, trainings will have little effect, as participants are not open to learning something new. Participants need to understand that obligatory trainings are of use for them.

Tip! The best solution is to integrate diversity topics into regular trainings and professional courses for e.g. human resources managers, accounting personnel etc. There is seldom a challenge in general to the idea that the personnel are to be given various types of training; including diversity training into these regular trainings, e.g. under the general heading of “how to deal with clients at the service desks” or “how to motivate employees”, serves the goal of making diversity management a natural component of daily routine.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

A lack of motivation by employees to participate in trainings.

One incentive concerning participation in voluntary trainings is if training certificates are seriously considered, or are considered a condition, in regard to promotion and career development.
Offer a workshop setting that allows participants to get advice on difficult situations in their work. People have an interest in feeling more competent in their daily work.

Participants want tailored strategies and “recipes” to deal with clients instead of subjecting themselves to self-reflection.

Encourage participants to develop strategies together. Make it clear that the self-reflection applies to everyone.

Political correctness in the administration sometimes hinders action and interaction.

Work on concrete examples on how to act in challenging situations.

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

→ Diversity trainings for city employees

LIMITATIONS

Trainings can address behaviour by helping individuals to adequately deal with challenging situations. They cannot compensate for problems that are produced by structural constraints, e.g. that a civil servant at a service desk has only 4 minutes per client and therefore gets stressed if a client requires more detailed advice.

Diversity training cannot compensate a lack of political will to provide for support and monitoring throughout the process of taking diversity into account in daily routines.

FOLLOW-UP

Follow-up events

Keep the topic on the department's agenda by

- regularly informing about initiatives/examples/events in the internal newsletter
- initiate follow-up networking events to exchange ideas on progress and examples

Reporting on progress and goal achievement

Measures to be implemented are developed in a participatory approach (see above). By definition, the composition of participants, the selection of priorities and the formulation of measures are not clear in advance. Therefore, do not set goals and benchmarks that will indicate failure where adapting something was necessary and useful (e.g. number of participants lower than expected/ different participants than expected but those participants might have been particularly motivated). Include reporting into existing reporting systems whenever possible. Any additional requirements will create opposition to the whole effort. It is important that departments do not find themselves pilloried through the monitoring, and that they do not perceive monitoring as an additional workload. Report the changes over time; report the process towards the goal as well as analysis of how the work is progressing.

Follow-up on trainings

Trainers suggested the following method to follow-up on trainings:

In the last session, encourage participants to formulate individual goals, what they would like to change/improve/do differently/try in their daily work routine. Agree on a follow-up workshop or answering a questionnaire/survey after 3-4 months to ask if they succeeded in acting according to their individual goals and if not, what hindered them in doing so.

According to the experience of the interviewees, many public employees would be interested in participating in long-term studies or surveys dealing with the implementation of the content of trainings or the recommendations developed through the trainings.

RISKS, CHALLENGES

Confusion about what the follow-up team is authorized to claim from the departments (what kind of reporting, information etc.).

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

A clear mandate for the follow-up team.



RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Direct supervision is not foreseen in many municipalities

Direct supervision would not be successful because diversity issues are issues of behaviour. Follow-up and enforcement need to take place through convincing and motivating behavioural change through successful examples. Peer-to-peer examples are the most convincing. Give active individuals a possibility to present their experiences. This is also a way to get recognition for their efforts, which motivates further action.

Establishing diversity as the norm

During the implementation process, it is necessary to make diversity measures visible. But in the long run, it is important to integrate the diversity perspective into trainings on other topics.

Tip! Many think the problem is attitudes, but this is simply not properly thought through. People can behave properly even if they have the wrong attitudes (sexist/racist etc.). Too often people have the right attitudes, good attitudes – but behave in a manner that does not reflect those attitudes. Naturally the issue is a combination of changing behaviour and attitudes, but all too often the focus is on attitudes. Most have good attitudes concerning gender equality, but we still get sex discrimination.

SUSTAINABILITY

Experience shows that the sustainable implementation of diversity requires a top-down approach. The top management needs to support diversity and diversity management and request its implementation at all levels. This may be difficult as the political parties in power can change. Sustainability requires firm leadership, insight, an understanding that this kind of policy will challenge established norms within the administration as well as within politics. An understanding that the process will be difficult, that it will take time, and at the same time the willingness to not allow the policy to get bogged down.

It is recommended structures and responsibilities are created to ensure the follow-up of activities, like a clear mandate for a follow-up team that has the power and the resources to take the role of a motor. The follow-up team also needs to be available for support to departments whenever difficulties arise during implementation of measures.

It is recommended that the coordination and follow-up is carried out by a team and not by a single person, to avoid unnecessary delays when one person leaves. While some cities think it is important that the political level and high level management are in charge of the follow-up (as a top-down approach), others recommend that it is done at the administrative level (in order to avoid re-opening debates on the initial political decisions).

Undertake efforts to maintain contacts once they have been established by initiating follow-up networking activities. Support networks and platforms of individuals who work on the topic. Networks help to empower and motivate people to keep working for a goal.

Sustainability requires successful results. Committed individuals work on that topic in addition to their usual workloads and dedicate time and energy. If it gets too frustrating, they will drop the work sooner or later.

In the long run, a value-oriented approach on diversity is more sustainable than a pure instrumental approach. The development of a diversity culture should build on the value of people rather than operational needs. Otherwise, the commitment to diversity will immediately stop as soon as it does not serve a specific instrumental need.

Having clear-cut goals also provides an aware civil society with the chance to follow up on the political promises that are inherent in such goals, which in turn can help to ensure the sustainability of the policy, even if political winds change.

The policy is transferable to any city. Large cities may need to implement such projects (particularly regarding service provision) on a district basis; small cities can do it at city level.

KEY FACTORS OF SUCCESS

Interviewees named the following aspects as key factors for successful implementation:

- Focus and determination from the top political leadership. It must be clear that diversity is a practical core issue of public administration rather than some theoretical issue.
- Personal contacts are established that allow for continuation and further development of a more comprehensive diversity strategy
- Measures are developed in a participatory approach with civil servants; including an openness to civil servants' suggestions. Participants have the positive feeling that they can initiate positive change in their working environment.
- Sufficient resources (staff and financial)
- Committed and active coordination and a follow-up team that functions as a motor for the entire process
- A diversity strategy that is embedded into the overall mission of the city administration.
- Diversity trainings that work with participants on their concrete experiences.
- Networking within and between city departments at the administrative level; follow-up reunions to exchange experiences on the process of implementation and good examples
- Peer-to-peer approach: A young public professional tells migrant teenagers his/her story; An HR manager tells others about a successful experience with diversity etc.
- Creation of structures and responsibilities for implementation to maintain and further develop implementation

IMPACT AND OUTCOME

Recognising the need of the city to understand its ethnically diverse population has allowed some focus on qualifications like language and diversity competence. This is combined with an increased awareness concerning discrimination, which in turn has led to an increase in persons with foreign background in higher positions.

- Recruitment processes are more carefully tuned to required qualifications
- Increased awareness on structural and interpersonal discrimination in administrative routines
- Increased share of personnel with foreign/ethnic backgrounds
- Increased share of personnel with foreign/ethnic backgrounds in higher positions
- Changes in the composition of personnel so that the personnel better reflect the population
- Continued measures over the period initially foreseen
- Established cooperation and networks
- Measures/projects that follow-up on or build on initial measures
- Diversity is perceived as a competence rather than a threat
- Increased satisfaction of clients with city services
- Personnel can successfully apply their language skills and social skills.
- Better mutual understanding for culturally based needs of colleagues, e.g. holidays, special dishes, traditions in case of family events such as funerals or births etc.
- Inclusion of diversity competence and multilingualism in job descriptions/job profiles/vacancies
- Heterogeneity of service users (do target groups that were underrepresented before make use of services now?)

→ DIVERSITY MONITORING

In order to evaluate the long-term impact of diversity management, periodic diversity monitoring is recommended.

The diversity monitoring serves to:

- assess diversity among the personnel
- evaluate the impact of diversity management
- identify selective recruitment patterns
- identify challenging issues, needs for action and promising practices
- promote an increase of diversity within the city administration
- provide an instrument to keep the cross-sectional topic of diversity on the agenda

Method

The city's departments and institutions (ideally all of them) are scrutinized periodically as to the degree of implementation of diversity management. Information is gathered via questionnaires covering the following dimensions: diversity in city staff (personnel and competences), accessibility of city services (services and clients) and organisation and strategy.

Periodically repeated data gathering can show the dynamics of development.

The following questionnaire, provided by the authorities of the city of Vienna, can serve as an excellent guideline for monitoring:

Questionnaire

1. Services & customers

- 1.1. How well do you know your customers?
 - 1.1.1. Who are your customers?
 - 1.1.2. How did the share of customers with migrant backgrounds develop over the last two years?
- 1.2. How do you assess and take into consideration the different needs of customers?
 - 1.2.1. Do you see any specific needs and demands from customers with migrant backgrounds?
 - 1.2.2. What do you do to provide your services in accordance to the needs of your customers with migrant backgrounds?
 - 1.2.3. How do you reach, inform and counsel your customers?
 - 1.2.4. In what languages do you communicate with your customers?
- 1.3. How do your customers with migrant backgrounds perceive and accept your services?
 - 1.3.1. Do you have any services that customers with migrant backgrounds use less often or hardly any time?

- 1.3.2. Did specific target group measures change the use of services by customers with migrant backgrounds?
- 1.3.3. How do you assess specific target group measures?
- 1.4. Review and outlook:
 - 1.4.1. What are, in your opinion, the benefits of diversity management for service provision?
 - 1.4.2. What are the challenges?
 - 1.4.3. Good practice examples in the area of service provision:

2. Staff & competences

- 2.1. How important is diversity competence/intercultural competence in your field of work?
 - 2.1.1. Is diversity competence/intercultural competence a criterion in staff selection?
 - 2.1.2. If you take diversity competence/intercultural competence into consideration in the selection procedure: What importance does it have?
 - 2.1.3. What languages are spoken by the employees of your department?
- 2.2. Is diversity competence/intercultural competence an objective of staff training?
 - 2.2.1. What kind of diversity trainings are taken by your employees?
 - 2.2.2. How many employees take diversity trainings?
 - 2.2.3. What do you do to increase participation in diversity trainings?
- 2.3. What origins do your employees have?
 - 2.3.1. How many of your employees do have migrant backgrounds?
 - 2.3.2. Are you trying to get employees with migrant backgrounds?
 - 2.3.3. Do you employ employees with migrant backgrounds in higher or leading positions respectively?
- 2.4. Review and outlook:
 - 2.4.1. What are, in your opinion, the benefits of diversity management in the area of staff & competences?
 - 2.4.2. What are the challenges?
 - 2.4.3. Good practice examples in the area of service provision:

3. Organisation & strategy

- 3.1. How important is diversity management in your organization?
 - 3.1.1. How present is the topic of diversity in your department?
 - 3.1.2. Is diversity management a structural element of organizational development?
 - 3.1.3. How do you deal with discrimination?
 - 3.1.4. What measures do you take to promote discussing the topic of diversity in your area of activities?
- 3.2. Review and outlook:
 - 3.2.1. What are, in your opinion, the benefits of diversity management in the area of organization & strategy?
 - 3.2.2. What are the challenges?
 - 3.2.3. Good practice examples in the area of service provision:

4. Your feedback to the monitoring:

RISKS, CHALLENGES

MEASURES TO MITIGATE RISKS

Questionnaires are perceived as annoying.

It is crucial to gain acceptance in the city departments for the monitoring, as it depends on their cooperation. Therefore the inclusion or association of higher level representatives from several city departments into the follow-up team is recommended. This will facilitate access to information and continuous exchange on monitoring results.
 Provide room for feedback on the method. Improvement of methods of data gathering and data evaluation will increase the commitment of the departments

Developing questionnaires, conducting data gathering and analyses requires specific know-how.

Cooperate with the department of statistics or external services for data gathering and processing.

It takes time to build the trust needed to answer honestly and self-critically concerning the questions.

Answers must be treated confidentially. Again, an inner-administrative follow-up team is recommended (do not hand the monitoring over to an external contractor): Administrative departments will be more confident that the information provided will not be used for public blaming and shaming and will feel that their point of view will be taken into account.

Ethnic data collection

The issue of equality data collection in European countries has long been more a question of political priorities rather than legality. This can be seen in the positions taken by the UK/Ireland (which allowed the collection of "ethnic" data) as opposed to much of continental Europe (which asserted that collection of ethnic data was illegal). Given the new Regulation (EU) 2016/679 which still speaks of 'special categories of personal data' such as ethnic data, it is clear that EU data protection law allows the collection and processing of such data, as long as the required safeguards are met. The key issues are informed consent to the processing of the data, after being adequately informed on the purpose and use of the data, and that there are adequate safeguards to prevent any other use of the collected data.

For further information on EU law on the issue of, among other things, ethnic data gathering, see European Handbook on Equality Data by Timo Makkonen (https://yhdenvertaisuus.fi-bin.directo.fi/@Bin/d1f76c2e9210cc88b1812f85c9112442/1487670156/application/pdf/117492/Europeanhandbook_WEB.pdf) and the European Network Against Racism documents at the at <http://enar-eu.org/Equality-data-collection-151>. Another important report that can provide some guidance is Patrick Simon's "Ethnic" statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries which was produced for ECRI. In particular it is worthwhile noting all of the data already collected by member countries (see the table on p 36) https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/activities/Themes/Ethnic_statistics_and_data_protection.pdf.

Local governments need to adapt their data collection to their local needs and circumstances. Nevertheless the work done in London may provide guidance to the possibilities that are available. See for example Equality and Inclusion in the City of London Corporation. Annual performance summary 2015. (<https://www.cityoflondon.gov.uk/about-the-city/how-we-make-decisions/Documents/equality-and-inclusion-annual-summary-2015.pdf>)

Note: Ethnic data collection should not be confused with 'ethnic profiling'. Ethnic profiling describes the practice of targeting specific individuals or groups based on appearance, e.g. if a police officer singles out a person for an identity or security check solely on the ground that he or she has dark skin colour. Ethnic profiling is a differentiation in treatment that is not objectively justified and therefore violates non-discrimination law.

RESOURCES AND EXAMPLES

Ghent (BE) Diversity management and recruiting

Monitoring existing recruiting strategies whether they are open to migrants and adaption in order to increase migrants among city staff. Diversity trainings for employees.

City of Ghent, ECCAR 10 Points Action Plan: <https://stad.gent/sites/default/files/page/documents/ECCAR%2010%20points%20action%20plan%20City%20of%20Ghent%202015-2019.pdf>

Bern (CH) Integration concrete 2014-2017

Action plan for mainstreaming diversity in city employment

<http://www.bern.ch/politik-und-verwaltung/stadtverwaltung/bss/kompetenzzentrum-integration/fachbereich-information-und-vernetzung/leitbild-zur-integrationspolitik>

Berlin (DE) Diversity in the Administration: Diversity in Service provision; Diversity in Recruitment; Trainings

Workshops with city employees to discuss and improve service provision for a diverse population. Trainings on how to interact with clients of diverse backgrounds in service encounters. Rethinking recruiting strategies to increase diversity in city staff. Diversity trainings for employees.

www.berlin.de/lb/ads/schwerpunkte/diversity/vielfalt-in-der-verwaltung/

Botkyrka (SE) Increasing the number of persons with an immigrant background among the personnel employed by the city

The policy is based on the idea that a better reflection of the community will lead to better service for the community. According to certain key personnel, Botkyrka has been able to increase the numbers of persons with an immigrant background. There is also an understanding that this needs to apply not just in general but also concerning management level employees.

Botkyrka's home page in English (only general information) <http://www.botkyrka.se/Sidor/Engelska.aspx>. More specific information in Swedish at: <http://www.botkyrka.se>

See in particular Multiyear plan 2011-2014 for sustainable development, Botkyrka, p 25 in Swedish. Flerårsplan 2011–2014 en plan för hållbar utveckling, Botkyrka s 25, 20160424, http://www.botkyrka.se/SiteCollectionDocuments/Kommun%20och%20politik/Flerårsplan_2011-2014.pdf

Belgium Federal Public Service: Diversity and HR: Belgian and international good practices 2010,

www.fedweb.belgium.be/sites/default/files/downloads/broch_po_diversite_bonnes_pratiques_EN.pdf

SPACE FOR NOTES

Why is it necessary?
Foundation
Putting into practice
Follow-up

SPACE FOR NOTES

SPACE FOR NOTES

